



# Bilingual Cardiff

## Review of the Bilingual Cardiff Strategy 2017-2022

## 1. Introduction

This report provides an independent external review of Cardiff Council's 5-year Strategy for a Bilingual Cardiff 2017-2022, published in draft in September 2016 and as a final document in March 2017.

This independent review was conducted by Nia Davies at Nico and commissioned in response to the formal Cabinet resolution on 16/03/2017 that *"an independent external review of the strategy and action plan take place"*.

The review was conducted during March 2018 and was informed by desktop research, a review of internal documentation relevant to the Bilingual Cardiff strategy, interviews, and a snapshot survey of key external partners and of colleagues across key partnership areas within the Council.

Research included consideration of the Welsh Language Commissioner's [Assurance Report for 2016-17](#) focussing on compliance and adequacy of Local Authority 5-year Welsh language promotion strategies, the Welsh Government's strategy: [Cymraeg 2050: a million Welsh speakers](#) published in July 2017, together with other local authority statutory Welsh language promotion strategies available as public documents.

This review looks at the strategy in its statutory and policy context; and, together with feedback from the survey and interviews, considers best practice identified by the Commissioner's report in terms of: compliance and governance, vision and ownership, consultation and communication, stakeholders, target setting and measuring performance. It then sets out the review's conclusions and recommendations for the consideration of Cardiff Council.

## Contents

<b>1.</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>2.</b>	<b>Summary</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>3.</b>	<b>Context</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>4.</b>	<b>The Strategy</b>	<b>10</b>
	i. compliance and governance	11
	ii. vision and ownership	15
	iii. consultation and communication	17
	iv. stakeholders	19
	v. targets and measuring performance	21
<b>5.</b>	<b>Findings</b>	<b>25</b>
<b>6.</b>	<b>Recommendations</b>	<b>28</b>
<b>7.</b>	<b>Appendix 1</b>	
<b>8.</b>	<b>Appendix 2</b>	

## 2. Summary

This review was conducted during March 2018.

The Bilingual Cardiff Strategy is a direct statutory requirement, however the Strategy is a culmination of wide-ranging strategic activity across the city by the Council and partners. It also acknowledges its relevance within the aims of the Welsh Government's national strategy for the language and its role within a wider policy context.

Considering the Strategy in light of identified best practice and stakeholder comments, this review finds that the Strategy has been built on strong foundations of consultation and communication and has a strong compliance and scrutiny framework in place.

The strategic priorities identified correspond with the national vision and are based on the close consultation with partners. They naturally reflect the specific needs of the population and are grouped under 3 strategic areas. The resulting targets are mindful of current provision and financial constraints and are seen to be realistic and achievable by key stakeholders.

The strategy draws from a purposeful vision supported by proactive leadership and key personnel and a robust accountability process which includes external scrutiny and involvement by key partners and a strong relationship through the Fforwm Caerdydd Ddwylieithog (Bilingual Cardiff Forum).

The many strengths of the Bilingual Cardiff Strategy should be celebrated and good practice shared. **There are a number of opportunities to consider further strengthening the implementation of the strategy, and the recommendations contained in this report attempt to highlight those opportunities in light of the findings and feedback from stakeholders. The recommendations are outlined on page 28 and 29.**

### 3. Context

The Bilingual Cardiff Strategy is a direct requirement of the Welsh Language Standards Regulations, but it also sits within a wider policy and legislative context.

The Strategy acknowledges its relevance within the aims of the Welsh Government strategy for the language, and its role alongside the Welsh in Education Strategic Plan for Cardiff, together with the aims of the Well-being Plan, Cardiff 2020 and the More than Just Words action plan.

#### *i. The Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011*

The Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011 established a legal framework to impose duties on certain organisations to comply with standards in relation to the Welsh language through regulations, (Welsh Language Standards (No.1) Regulations 2015). The standards issued to Cardiff Council are listed in [The City of Cardiff Council Compliance Notice – Section 44 Welsh Language \(Wales\) Measure 2011](#).

The standards relevant to the 5-year strategy are Standards 145 and 146 and they require that Cardiff Council:

- produce and publish a 5-year strategy that sets out how the Council propose to promote the Welsh language and facilitate the use of Welsh more widely in the area;
- include a target for increasing or maintaining the number of Welsh speakers in the area by the end of the 5 year period;
- include a statement setting out how the Council intend reaching that target;
- review the strategy and publish a revised version on the website within 5 years of publishing the strategy (or of publishing a revised strategy);

- after 5 years, assess to what extent the Council has followed the strategy and reached the target;
- publish the assessment on the website to show the number of Welsh speakers in the area together with their age;
- outline in the assessment a list of the activities arranged or funded by the Council to promote the use of Welsh during the past 5 years.

There are further considerations within the Regulations relevant to the 5-year strategy under Supplementary Matters (Standards 173 and 174) requiring bodies to:

- ensure that a document recording the promotion standards with which the Council are required to comply is available to the public;
- provide the Commissioner with any information she requests regarding compliance with the promotion standards.

## *ii. Cymraeg 2050: a million Welsh speakers*

Published in July 2017, following the announcement in August 2016 of its vision to create a million Welsh speakers, the Cymraeg 2050 Strategy sets out the Welsh Government's long-term approach to achieving the target of a million Welsh speakers by 2050.

The strategy is based on three strategic themes:

1. Increasing the number of Welsh speakers
2. Increasing the use of Welsh
3. Creating favourable conditions – infrastructure and context

The overarching targets for Cymraeg 2050 are:

- The number of Welsh speakers to reach 1 million by 2050.

- The percentage of the population that speak Welsh daily, and can speak more than just a few words of Welsh, to increase from 10 per cent (in 2013–15) to 20 per cent by 2050.

The Government has published the first [Work Programme](#) for the strategy. It sets out aim-by-aim what the Government intends to do during the period 2017 to 2021. In terms of this initial programme of work, it is worth noting the Government's own words:

*“The initial years will focus on setting solid foundations. This is a slow and steady approach, which may lack the obvious signs of success. However, we see it as an absolute necessity to lay the foundations now in order to support future phases of the strategy's delivery.”*

This approach is key to a long term strategy of language planning and growth, and is important that this is borne in mind in terms of the targets set in the 5-year Bilingual Cardiff Strategy. It underlines the importance of establishing a firm basis in the initial years towards achieving the long term target of doubling the number of its Welsh speakers by 2050.

The Government's strategy acknowledges the role of local authorities in achieving its aims across Wales, and accordingly, the Bilingual Cardiff Strategy mission statement places the Government's vision at the forefront of its purpose:

**Mission Statement**

**Work with partners to double the number of Welsh speakers in Cardiff by 2050 through the Bilingual Cardiff Strategy, in line with Welsh Government's vision.**

*iii. Education*

Echoing the national strategy, both the Bilingual Cardiff Strategy and the Welsh in Education Strategic Plan for Cardiff recognise that the education system is a key element in creating new speakers.

*“This WESP is an integral part of the Council’s 5-year Bilingual Cardiff strategy. The most prominent area of interdependency between both strategies is based on strategic area 1: Families, Children and Young People. The priorities within this area are based on promotion, provision and progression.”*

The Government have noted their plans to review legislation underpinning Welsh education planning together with reviewing the process for increasing the proportion of Welsh-medium teaching and learning in schools and that the 21<sup>st</sup> Century Schools Capital Programme ensures the growth of Welsh medium school places.

They have indicated that they *“will move from measuring the demand for Welsh-medium education to growing Welsh-medium education systematically and proactively”*.

This underlines the expectation of further developments in legislation and policy over the next five years and that the direction of travel for Cardiff Council will continue towards an ambitious and challenging programme of work.

#### *iv. Wellbeing*

Local Well-being Plans are intended to provide a more holistic approach to planning and delivery of public services in Wales, including better integration of many relevant acts, duties and planning frameworks. One of the well-being goals under the Act is 'a Wales of vibrant culture and thriving Welsh language'. However, it is important to recognise that there is a close link between the language and all other well-being goals and the importance of wider partnerships and frameworks.

The aim of the Bilingual Cardiff Strategy is reinforced within the draft Well-being Plan:

*“Aim to double the number of Welsh speakers in Cardiff by 2050 through supporting the delivery of the Bilingual Cardiff Strategy.”*

The draft Plan outlines progress measures in terms of speaker numbers/education:

- People who can speak Welsh (National Indicator 37)
- Key Stage 4 Pupils Achieving the Level 2 Threshold including English/Welsh & Maths (National Indicator)

The Welsh Language Commissioner has recently published an advice document: [Considering the Welsh language in the Local Well-being Plans](#) which explores how Local Well-being Plans could consider each Well-being goal in the context of the Welsh language. This may assist in further strengthening the links between the aims of both strategies.

*v. Local Authorities 5-year promotion strategies*

In the [2016-17 Assurance Report, Rights Taking Root](#), the Welsh Language Commissioner looked at the 5-year strategies of local authorities and the national parks in Wales. This report provides an analysis of compliance together with the features required for strong and effective promotion strategies. The Commissioner identified the following elements as examples of good practice against which this review will consider the Bilingual Cardiff Strategy:

**Ownership and accountability:** Some strategies demonstrate clear ownership by the whole organisation... and a clear accountability structure for implementation and assessment of progress.

**Baseline:** The most comprehensive strategies have based their targets and action plans for the promotion and facilitation of the language on qualitative and quantitative evidence.

**Clear vision:** A clear statement of vision serves not only to enable the public to understand the aims of the organisation, but also helps the staff of the organisation, who have to implement the relevant actions.

**Partners:** The most comprehensive action plans extend to every relevant area and demonstrate a commitment to work in partnership with organisations in the public and private sector together with the third sector, and of course local people.

**The wider context:** The most comprehensive strategies deal with the wider context of the growth and vitality of the Welsh language, the local social / economic context; cross references with WESPS and other strategies that overlap locally and nationally.

**Measuring progress:** The most comprehensive strategies set clear targets, strategic priorities, quantitative indicators, and a detailed action plan with clear links between activities and strategic priorities. The most comprehensive action plans set out targets with clear timescales and responsibilities.

(2016-17 Assurance Report, Rights Taking Root)

It is very difficult to benchmark the Bilingual Cardiff strategy against other local authority strategies as they have all been drawn up in response to a wide variety of linguistic needs specific to their areas.

However it is possible to identify compliance with the requirements of standard 145, and to offer an opinion on the robustness and scope of the strategy against best practice highlighted in the Commissioner's report and alongside the strategic priorities contained in the national strategy, Cymraeg 2050. The following sections of this report outline relevant considerations.

## 4. The Strategy

### Vision

Our vision is to develop a truly bilingual Cardiff. A Cardiff where our citizens can live, work and play, as well as access services and support in Welsh or English equally. A capital city where bilingualism is promoted as something completely natural, and where the Welsh language is protected and nurtured for future generations to use and enjoy.

Approved by full Council on the 23rd of March 2017, the Bilingual Cardiff Strategy notes *“This is a strategy for the city as a whole, not for any one organisation”*, highlighting the importance of strategic partners and working across a number of key policy areas.

As well as specific actions to facilitate the use of the language across a wide range of strategic priorities in collaboration with partners across the Council and externally, the Strategy includes a target to increase the number of Welsh speakers (aged 3+) in Cardiff by 15.9% from 36,735 (2011 Census) to 42,584 (2021 Census).

The strategic priorities were developed in consultation with partners, naturally reflecting the specific needs of the population. The priorities are grouped under 3 strategic areas that also reflect key priority headings contained within the Welsh Government’s own strategy.

For this review, a snapshot survey was conducted during March 2018 to gather stakeholder views on the Bilingual Cardiff Strategy. This was intentionally limited to key external partners amongst the members of Fforwm Caerdydd Ddwyeithog (the Welsh Language Forum) and also key partners from within the Council in various departments relevant to the implementation of the strategy which resulted in 12 respondents.

*“The Strategy provides a clear vision for the Welsh language in Cardiff”*

*“The strategy has brought partners together in collaboration”*

(Comments from key stakeholders)

The responses provided by the key partners, have given a useful insight into the strengths of the strategy and possible opportunities to strengthen and develop the strategy over its lifetime from the point of view of partners. Appendix 1 contains a full report of the stakeholder survey. Appendix 2 contains a copy of the questionnaire.

### ***i compliance and governance***

Key questions:

- Does Cardiff Council comply with the relevant Welsh language standards?
- Is there a sufficiently robust system in place to provide effective scrutiny and challenge for the strategy?

In both these areas, this review found that Cardiff Council has a strong compliance and scrutiny provision in place:

**Compliance:** Although the vision and aim of the strategy is far-reaching, the compliance of the Strategy with two standards will be a particular focus for the Welsh Language Commissioner as the regulatory body.

Cardiff Council have produced and published the strategy which sets out how they intend to promote the Welsh language and facilitate the use of Welsh more widely. It also includes a target for increasing the number of Welsh speakers by the end of the 5 year period including setting out how the Council intend reaching that target. These elements are in direct response to the requirements of Standard 145.

Meeting Standard 146 in due course will mean reviewing the strategy at the end of the 5-year period and assessing to what extent the Council has followed the strategy and reached the target, outlining the number of

Welsh speakers and a list of activities arranged or funded to promote the language over the 5-year period.

This therefore entails maintaining a record of progress in terms of achieving the targets set out in the action plan together with evidence that shows progress towards the overarching target of increasing the number of Welsh speakers. This evidence requires a variety of quantitative and qualitative information collated by the Council and by external partners.

A note of caution was sounded by one respondent to the stakeholder survey, who raised the issue of the reliance on external partners for the collation of some of the required evidence:

*“Unsure how measurable some of the targets are as they are ‘city wide’ and require input from a number of organisations who need to ‘count’ the same thing. Is there a shared understanding/agreement about this?”*

With quarterly meetings held with the Fforwm Caerdydd Ddwyeithog (the Welsh Language Forum comprised of the key partners involved), together with a recently renewed terms of reference focussing on the implementation of the Strategy itself, it appears that there is sufficient opportunity to ensure clarity and understanding on what is measured and how. However, it may be beneficial to look again at these requirements to ensure robust record keeping and evidence.

**Scrutiny:** As mentioned above, the Strategy is subject to a good degree of external overview and monitoring through the quarterly Fforwm Caerdydd Ddwyeithog, reinforced by its new terms of reference, specifically centred on the implementation of the Strategy.

The stakeholder survey asked external partners whether the Fforwm was an effective mechanism for monitoring the implementation of the strategy and acting as a critical friend to the Council, and all respondents agreed that it was.

A meeting of the Fforwm was observed as part of this review which found that the Fforwm is an opportunity for partners to provide an update on progress with targets within their remit and to provide a challenge to Cardiff Council on its own progress. Together, partners are able to respond and adapt effectively to any changes or factors impacting on the action plan and exploit any new opportunities that arise. One comment made during the meeting, captured this:

*“Targets and priorities can become dated and opportunities to take action arise unexpectedly, but it is also important not to avoid things that are difficult or challenging, and just target Welsh speakers.”*

Under their newly revised terms of reference the Fforwm report to the cross-party group of members who make up the Bilingual Cardiff Member Working Group that meet each quarter (e.g. in April 2018 2 key partners, the Menter and the Eisteddfod, were invited to give a presentation to the Group). The Chair of the Working Group writes formally to the Cabinet following each meeting to inform Cabinet members of any Welsh language issues.

Additionally the Head of Bilingual Cardiff meets monthly with the Council Leader, who holds the portfolio on the Welsh language.

As yet, there are no formal requirements to report annually on the implementation of the Strategy to the Welsh Language Commissioner, however an update on the progress of the Strategy is provided by Cardiff Council within the Annual Report on the Welsh Language Standards. This annual report is presented to Full Council allowing another level of scrutiny together with an opportunity to promote the comprehensive programme of work undertaken by Bilingual Cardiff on a Council-wide level.

**Sufficient resources:** A key element of good governance is ensuring sufficient resources with ensuing risk to success if insufficient resources are available to underpin important targets.

The stakeholder survey asked whether stakeholders thought the Council has the appropriate resources to implement the strategy, and of those that

responded (10) 6 said that they did not think there were sufficient resources for this strategy. This response was consistent across internal and external partners.

*“The partner organisations must be supported and funding should not be cut in order to ensure the growth of Welsh services across the city.”*

*“Appropriate resources should be provided by the Council to the Urdd to achieve the aims of this Strategy”*

The action plan was drawn up with current financial limitations in mind and draws upon current provision and planning across partnerships. However, areas for consideration are highlighted further on in this report and it would be beneficial to consider any potential risks that may arise in future. A National Audit Office Report entitled ‘Over-optimism in government projects (2013), explores risks in large projects and strategies due to over-ambitious expectations. It warns that optimism can lead to a tendency to underestimate the challenges of complex visions in terms of the limitations of capacity, time and financial constraints.

**For further consideration**

R1. Consider a review of *what* is measured, (and when, how and by whom) to reinforce shared understanding, robust record keeping and evidence of progress towards the strategic priorities and overarching target.

## *ii vision and ownership*

Key questions:

- Is there a clear vision and definition of purpose?
- Is there clear ownership and leadership for the strategy and its implementation?

The Bilingual Cardiff Strategy is notable in that its vision and purpose is clearly stated, and is reinforced by support from the leadership within the Council. This is not only apparent within the document, but is seen in terms of the profile and 'brand' of Bilingual Cardiff, and the support voiced regularly by the Leader for the vision of developing a truly bilingual city.

To strengthen its commitment further, the Council have recently drawn up an internal policy document on the use of Welsh within the Council with the vision of becoming a bilingual organisation, valuing and supporting the use of Welsh among staff. This will allow the Council to lead by example and encourage the use of Welsh across the city.

**Vision:** As stated earlier, the Strategy acknowledges its place within the national vision and clearly outlines its responsibility in terms of increasing the number of Welsh speakers. The vision also outlines what a successful Bilingual Cardiff will look, feel and sound like and the Strategy is based on three strategic areas with relevant priorities and targets for action.

In the stakeholder survey, all respondents noted their awareness and understanding of the vision for a Bilingual Cardiff. However, 5 of the 7 internal respondents agreed with the statement *"I have my own understanding of the vision for a Bilingual Cardiff, but I'm not sure if everyone else's understanding corresponds to mine"*.

Two of the 5 external partners also agreed with the above statement, with 3 of the 5 stating that their understanding was *"Very clear, you would hear the same description of the vision by everyone"*.

This finding would reinforce the importance of continued support and engagement to articulate the vision in contexts that are relevant to

different sections of the Council and amongst partners in general over the strategy's lifetime.

**Ownership:** As noted above, in promoting the vision, the Leader of Cardiff Council has on more than one occasion articulated the responsibility of the Council in achieving the Strategy, but also reinforces the fact that it is a city-wide responsibility, reliant on key partners.

The stakeholder survey shared this view in that the strategy has ensured every partner is part of the vision, bringing them together in collaboration and drawing on the expertise and capacity of a number of partners, making the most of Cardiff's position as a capital city. However, some comments highlighted concerns that ownership was not shared consistently amongst some key (internal and external) partners, one for example, noted:

*"The Bilingual Cardiff team have clear commitment and vision regarding the Welsh language. However, it is my impression that these features are rather inconsistent across the remainder of the Council. It would be beneficial for some departments, the education department in particular, to ensure more initiative is shown regarding the language as there is the potential to achieve much more with understanding and commitment."*

#### **For further consideration**

R2 Consider exploring further the definition of what a truly bilingual Cardiff means in quantifiable terms in the context of the strategic priorities. Also, consider linking measurable key indicators and milestones of success to the action plan so that all partners are clear on what is to be achieved and evidenced.

R3 Ensure continued support and engagement to articulate the vision in contexts that are relevant to different sections of the Council, and amongst partners in general over the strategy's lifetime. This will assist in strengthening shared purpose and achievement of the strategy.

### ***iii Consultation and communication***

Key questions:

- Did the Council consult sufficiently on the Strategy?
- Does the Council continue to consult and communicate effectively?

The consultation on the Strategy was one of the most comprehensive and inclusive programmes of consultation held on any 5-year Welsh language promotion strategy.

**Consultation:** The consultation process began with an internal consultation and online survey which attracted around 40 responses from a diverse cross-section of departments. These comments formed the basis for the draft priorities which were then developed in further consultation with policy officers, heads of service, Welsh Language Coordinators and Champions group, Internal equality networks, the Bilingual Cardiff member Working Group, and the Policy Review & Performance Committee.

According to an officer in the Bilingual Cardiff team, *“although this meant a significant amount of work, it was extremely beneficial to have conducted such a thorough internal consultation as various departments now have an understanding of the value of the strategy and share ownership of it”*.

Public consultation on the Bilingual Cardiff strategy was carried out in autumn 2016 with over 70 per cent of respondents either strongly agreeing or tending to agree with the vision of a truly bilingual Cardiff and over 53 per cent agreeing with the target of increasing the number of Welsh speakers in the city.

As part of the consultation, a workshop event was held on the 20 October 2016, with 26 main partners and stakeholders. Attendees included Welsh Government, the Welsh Language Commissioner, Cardiff University, the Public Service Board organisations, Menter Caerdydd, and Urdd Gobaith Cymru.

In terms of the stakeholder survey, all of the respondents agreed that sufficient opportunity was given to enable people to provide input to the Strategy.

**Communication:** In terms of communication, most respondents to the survey (10 out of the 12) agreed that the Council continues to communicate effectively in the implementation of the Strategy.

During the meeting of the Fforwm, it was suggested that invitations to a wider spread of partners could be sent out on annual basis to hold a Fforwm meeting to include stakeholders that do not usually attend in order to widen input. This would then provide an effective platform for Bilingual Cardiff to update a wider audience of stakeholders on progress, to ensure practical input from partners, and to reinforce the city-wide ownership of the vision.

According to one survey respondent:

*“There should be representation of all partners on the Fforwm, e.g. include representative from the education department in order to move things forward and not just depend on the Welsh language partners to achieve the core work.”*

#### **For further consideration**

R4 As suggested in the Fforwm meeting, consider the possibility of extending a Fforwm meeting once a year to a wider partnership to allow Bilingual Cardiff to ensure practical input from partners of all interests, and to reinforce the city-wide ownership of the vision.

## ***iv stakeholders***

Key question:

- Have key stakeholders been identified, their support secured, and their contribution, influence and needs understood?

The Bilingual Cardiff Strategy is firmly based on the groundwork carried out initially in 2014 to identify and engage with key partners in order to deliver the vision of a bilingual city.

***Key stakeholders:*** As the Strategy itself acknowledges, its success is dependent on external as well as internal partners.

The 2014 conference enabled partners to explore and articulate the issues and priorities that would firstly lead to the establishment of yr Hen Lyfrgell as a vibrant centre for the Welsh language in the city centre, and secondly, form a strong partnership basis for the 5-year Bilingual Cardiff Strategy. This was reinforced by the Bilingual Cardiff Conference held in autumn 2016 which allowed partners and stakeholders to discuss and collaborate on the draft Strategy.

The stakeholder survey asked for feedback on the strengths and weaknesses of the Strategy. There were positive comments in the main regarding the ability of the Strategy to draw people together:

*“The strategy has brought partners together in collaboration without duplicating work.”*

However, some comments highlighted opportunities for further engagement and understanding, and consideration of how the Strategy is communicated and framed in terms of ownership and participation over its lifetime:

*“It does not engage with the Welsh language voluntary sector within the city.”*

*“There is a feeling that the Council has relinquished some of its responsibilities and transferred them to the partners.”*

According to the stakeholder survey, 9 of the 12 agreed that the Council understands the importance of stakeholders in order to ensure the successful implementation of the Strategy.

When asked about the support of stakeholders, of those who answered (10), 4 expressed concern that the Council has not yet ensured the support of all stakeholders, whilst 6 disagreed with this statement.

When asked about whether stakeholders realise the importance of their contribution to ensuring the success of the strategy, there was a slight difference in response, with 4 of the 5 internal partners agreeing with the statement that some stakeholders within the Council may not realise the importance of their contribution to ensuring the success of the strategy. With the external partners, 2 of the 5 agreed with this statement.

**For further consideration**

R5 Consider developing and maintaining a stakeholder management plan in order to sustain and nurture the positive relationship with key stakeholders over the lifetime of the Strategy.

R6 Consider developing and maintaining a programme of communication to support the implementation of the Strategy.

## *v targets and measuring performance*

Key questions:

- Are targets based on a clear baseline and are they clear, practicable and realistic?
- What evidence will be available to show the success of the strategy and to what extent is it possible to define measurable change following specific actions?

The target of doubling the number of Welsh speakers by 2050 is based on clear statistical analysis; and as seen above, strategic priorities and targets in the Strategy have been set following consultation with all stakeholders involved and there is systematic reporting on progress against a clear action plan.

**Baseline:** A clear baseline allows for measurable targets. The overarching target of increasing the number of Welsh speakers in Cardiff was based on work carried out in conjunction with the Cardiff Research Centre taking into account statistical and demographic analysis alongside the required increase in numbers to determine the percentage increase needed year on year.

The Council's main sources of data regarding the number of Welsh speakers in its population, apart from the 2021 Census, are education data (PLASC) and workforce data which will allow the Council to track any trends and progress toward the target on an annual basis.

In the survey, one respondent commented:

*“ The main long term target for the Strategy, doubling the number of Welsh speakers in Cardiff by 2050, is aligned with the target in Cymraeg 2050, the Welsh Government’s strategy... Cardiff’s Welsh speakers doubled between 1991 and 2011 which suggests that this target is not too ambitious.”*

In terms of the targets contained in the action plan aimed at achieving the strategic priorities identified, according to one respondent to the survey, reflecting upon the process undertaken internally:

*“We agreed the service area targets with the Welsh Language Unit through face to face meetings in order to ensure that the targets were realistic and achievable.”*

However, a number of the activities are beyond the direct influence of the Council and are within the remit and work programmes of partners. These targets are reported on in the quarterly Fforwm.

In the survey, when asked about the targets within the Strategy relevant to their areas of work, 8 of the 12 respondents agreed that the Strategy’s targets were realistic and achievable. One external partner and 3 internal partners expressed uncertainty as to whether or not they were realistic or too ambitious.

**Strategic priorities:** Cardiff’s strategic priorities were developed in close consultation with partners, naturally reflecting the specific needs of its population. The priorities are grouped under 3 strategic areas and provide stated outcomes for reporting progress on the use of the Welsh language in Cardiff. Therefore there is a clear and rational basis for the strategy, covering all relevant strategic priorities that also reflect key priority headings contained within the Welsh Government’s own strategy.

When asked about their views on the strategic priorities of the strategy, 9 of the 12 respondents agreed that the aim of the Strategy fits with the priorities of their own departments or organisations in general. This reflects the successful initial consultation process enabling the Strategy to be dovetailed effectively with wider strategic goals.

As the Bilingual Cardiff Strategy was drawn up prior to the publishing of the national strategy, a clause was included suggesting that a review of the strategy may be appropriate to align it more closely with the national document. As there are many interdependencies and targets dependant on external stakeholders with varying funding cycles, a review of the action plan itself may be wise before the mid-point of the lifetime of the strategy.

**Measuring performance:** There is a clear scrutiny and reporting structure for the Strategy. As noted in section 4(i) on compliance and governance, progress towards both the strategic priorities and the overarching target of increasing the number of Welsh speakers, will need to be measured in a meaningful and effective way, with a variety of quantitative and qualitative evidence.

It is notable that this wide-ranging and ambitious strategy is not in receipt of additional funding or a specific budget, and is therefore based on the current capacity and activities of the Council and partners. As noted in section 4(ii), a lack of sufficient resources was highlighted as a concern for 6 out of the 10 respondents.

Conducting a review of the action plan in due course may highlight potential strategic gaps that simply aren't possible to address without funding. However despite the lack of available funding, these gaps should be highlighted if it is deemed that there is a risk to the success of any strategic priority if these gaps are not addressed.

One possible area in the current action plan that could be explored in such a review, is the priority area regarding children and young people. As identified in the Strategy and also the national strategy, the post-16 phase is critical in terms of language progression. It marks the period for many between statutory education and the workplace and this is the time when a number of factors may impact individuals' linguistic decisions and practices for the rest of their lives. It is also clear that this is the time when a significant number of Welsh speakers lose their Welsh language skills.

The Council have identified that this is a priority area with the target to:

*Increase the provision of Welsh-medium extra-curricular activities and opportunities for children and young people to use Welsh outside the school gates.*

Three main targets were included under this priority. The first has been subject to change following discussion at the Fforwm and may be adapted. The second involves activities around the 2018 National Eisteddfod in

Cardiff and is timetabled to end in August 2018. The third (Welsh Music Day) has already been achieved, (but is likely to be repeated annually). This points to further possibilities and future developments that will benefit from being recorded formally in an updated action plan.

### **For further consideration**

R7 In conjunction with R1 and R2, consider reviewing the action plan in consultation with key partners (by the end of year 2, March 2019), with a view to updating or adapting the targets. *[As part of any review, consider how the achievement of any new or adapted targets will align with the requirements to report on progress in terms of i) the increase in the number of Welsh speakers and ii) the increase in the use of Welsh and what is the quantitative and qualitative evidence required.]*

R8 When conducting a review of the action plan, consider identifying any key strategic areas that aren't sufficiently covered in the current action plan so that a record or 'wish list' is kept should any co-funding or co-production opportunities arise. Also, any risks arising from lack of resources or change in circumstances that would impact on the successful achievement of any strategic priorities should be recorded.

## 5. Findings

Considering the Bilingual Cardiff Strategy in light of identified best practice and stakeholder comments as outlined above, the review finds that the Strategy has been built on strong foundations of consultation and communication.

The strategic priorities identified correspond with the national vision and are based on the consultation process. The resulting targets are mindful of current provision and financial constraints and are seen to be realistic and achievable by key stakeholders.

The strategy draws from a purposeful vision supported by proactive leadership and key personnel, and a robust accountability process which includes external scrutiny and involvement by key partners and a strong relationship through the Fforwm.

This is reiterated in comments made by stakeholders when asked their opinion on what the strengths of the Strategy were. The main comments included:

- The strategy is a multi-agency strategy. It has ensured that every major partner is part of the vision and has brought partners together in collaboration without duplicating work.
- The strategy provides a clear vision for the Welsh language in Cardiff and sets out the priorities of the Council and the direction of travel.
- The strategy draws on the expertise and the capacity of a number of organisations and also makes the most of Cardiff's position as a capital city.
- The support from the current and previous leadership.
- It is an accepted strategy within the structure of the Council and backed by legislation.
- The strategy identifies priority areas and it is accompanied by an action plan to help deliver priorities.
- The strategy is not a long document, but shorter in style making it more appealing to audiences.

*Areas for further consideration:*

Despite the limitations of the stakeholder questionnaire, it invited brief comments of critical reflection and suggested areas of opportunity. Although it did not allow for a more detailed analysis, the comments threw light upon some issues that partners may be encountering. A review of the action plan would inevitably include partners, and the points raised might be a useful checklist for further engagement. For example, some key partners think there is potential to achieve much more with education and young people, together with extending engagement with the voluntary sector in Cardiff. Therefore in updating and reviewing the action plan for the years to come, these points could be explored and partners could be invited to suggest ideas and options for strategic priorities and partnership collaboration.

Further challenges and areas for consideration as identified by the stakeholders included:

- A longer timeframe could be considered to allow a more strategic view to be highlighted, accompanied with a set review period where the document can be updated to reflect the trends of a dynamic city.
- There can be a negative perception towards the language within the Council.
- The Council is not in direct control of all actions in action plan.
- There is a feeling that the Council has relinquished some of its responsibilities and transferred them to the partners and as a result strategy might dominate the work of the Fforwm with too much emphasis put on the Council's work.
- There should be representation of all partners on the Fforwm, e.g. include representative from the education department in order to move things forward and not just depend on the Welsh language partners to achieve the core work.
- An over-reliance on the local authority to deliver all changes without acknowledging the important role that all organisations can play through partnership delivery.

- Ensuring sufficient resources (financial and staff) across all aspects of the priority areas achieve the strategy's aims.
- Opportunity to further raise the profile and status of the Welsh language in Cardiff.
- With the growth of Welsh medium education, and the recent comments of the Leader encouraging a proactive approach in promoting the benefits of Welsh medium education, there is considerable potential to improve the current situation.
- To aid the communication of the implementation of the strategy, a standing item could be added to each WEF meeting agenda.

## 6. Recommendations

The many strengths of the Bilingual Cardiff Strategy should be celebrated and good practice shared. There are a number of opportunities to consider further strengthening the implementation of the strategy and the following recommendations attempt to highlight those opportunities in light of the findings and feedback from stakeholders.

- R1 Consider a review of *what* is measured, (and when, how and by whom) to reinforce shared understanding, robust record keeping and evidence of progress towards the strategic priorities and overarching target.
- R2 Consider exploring further the definition of what a truly bilingual Cardiff means in quantifiable terms in the context of the strategic priorities. In addition, consider linking measurable key indicators and milestones of success clearly to the action plan so that all partners are clear on what is to be achieved and evidenced.
- R3 Ensure continued support and engagement to articulate the vision in contexts that are relevant to different sections of the Council, and amongst partners in general over the strategy's lifetime. This will assist in strengthening shared purpose and achievement of the strategy.
- R4 As suggested in the Fforwm meeting, consider the possibility of extending a Fforwm meeting once a year to a wider partnership to allow Bilingual Cardiff to ensure practical input from partners of all interests, and to reinforce the city-wide ownership of the vision.
- R5 Consider developing and maintaining a stakeholder management plan in order to sustain and nurture the positive relationship with key stakeholders over the lifetime of the Strategy.
- R6 Consider developing and maintaining a programme of communication to support the implementation of the Strategy.

- R7 In conjunction with R1 and R2, consider reviewing the action plan in consultation with key partners (by the end of year 2, March 2019), with a view to updating or adapting the targets. *[As part of any review, consider how the achievement of any new or adapted targets will align with the requirements to report on progress in terms of i) the increase in the number of Welsh speakers and ii) the increase in the use of Welsh and what is the quantitative and qualitative evidence required.]*
- R8 When conducting a review of the action plan, consider identifying any key strategic areas that aren't sufficiently covered in the current action plan so that a record or 'wish list' is kept should any co-funding or co-production opportunities arise. Also, any risks arising from lack of resources or change in circumstances that would impact on the successful achievement of any strategic priorities should be recorded.

**End/diwedd**